

ART TEACHER RECRUITMENT & RETENTION TASK FORCE

SUPPORTING OUR CURRENT & FUTURE VISUAL ARTS, DESIGN, & MEDIA ARTS EDUCATORS



REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS 2023-2024



ART TEACHER RECRUITMENT & RETENTION TASK FORCE

SUPPORTING OUR CURRENT & FUTURE VISUAL ARTS, DESIGN, & MEDIA ARTS EDUCATORS

Dear Education Community:

The National Art Education Association (NAEA) is committed to supporting current and future visual arts, design, and media arts educators—especially in light of increased teacher burnout, school violence, cultural conflicts, and unsatisfactory working conditions. Recognizing these challenges, the NAEA Board of Directors formed the Visual Arts, Design, and Media Arts Teacher Recruitment & Retention Task Force to investigate and address obstacles in visual arts education.

Serving as Co-Chairs of the Task Force between March 2023 and April 2024, we focused on finding possible solutions to help alleviate the critical challenges that art teachers are facing, as well as suggesting creative ways to recruit new art teachers. We led the eight members of the Task Force to find actionable recommendations to support the recruitment of new art teachers and retain existing art teachers nationwide.

The eight members of the Task Force represented NAEA's seven Divisions and four Regions. The Task Force gathered extensive data through surveys and engaged with members, peer organizations, and experts.

In our final 13 recommendations to the NAEA Board of Directors, we emphasize community engagement, professional development, and administrative support. We intend to focus on pragmatic approaches, such as creating guidance documents for school administrators and developing targeted professional development and mentorship programs.

The following report includes findings from the Task Force's extensive survey and 13 recommendations, which are divided into short-, mid-, and long-term action plans. By focusing on practical solutions, we are committed to making a real difference for all visual arts, design, and media arts educators across the country.

Sincerely,

Theresa McGee & Cathy Rosamond

NAEA Visual Arts, Design, and Media Arts Teacher Recruitment & Retention Task Force Co-Chairs

NAEA Visual Arts, Design, and Media Arts Teacher Recruitment & Retention Task Force

Co-Chairs: Theresa McGee, Cathy Rosamond

Task Force Members: Caitlin Deutsch, Eastern Region/Museum Division; Alexandra Heine, Eastern Region/Preservice Division; Nick Hostert, Western Region/Secondary Division; Cam McComb, Western Region/Higher Education; Dana Monroe, Pacific Region/Elementary Division; Harmony Murray, Eastern Region/Middle Level Division, Tempa Nyswaner, Southeastern Region/Supervision & Administration Division; Alicia Robinson, Eastern Region/Elementary Division

Expert Contributors: Tina Atkinson, Lucy Bartholomee, LaDonna Canup, Paige Colwell, Erick Figueras, Christina Hanawalt, Le Ann Hinkle, Alicia Peters, Stephanie Silverman, Lisa Stuart, Kristin Vanderlip Taylor, Libba Willcox

CONTENTS

Introduction	.1
The Charge	.1
Background	.1
Baseline Survey for State Leaders	.2
The Core Work of the Task Force	.2
The National Survey	.3
Findings	.4
Recruitment	.5
Retention	.8
Recommendations to the Board	.11
Short-Term Recommendations	.12
Mid-Term Recommendations	.14
Long-Term Recommendations	.18
References	.20

ABOUT THE NATIONAL ART EDUCATION ASSOCIATION

Founded in 1947, the National Art Education Association (NAEA) is the leading professional membership organization exclusively for visual arts, design, and media arts education professionals. Members include preK, elementary, middle, and high school visual arts educators; college and university professors; university students preparing to become educators; researchers and scholars; teaching artists; administrators and supervisors; and art museum educators—as well as more than 54,000 students who are members of the National Art Honor Society. We represent members in all 50 states plus the District of Columbia, U.S. Possessions, most Canadian provinces, U.S. military bases around the world, and 25+ foreign countries.

www.arteducators.org

METIS ASSOCIATES

Metis Associates, an educational research firm based in New York with a specialization in arts education and engagement, assisted in the analysis of the quantitative and qualitative data gathered through the NAEA Taskforce National Survey.

View the "Art Teacher Recruitment and Retention Task Force: 2023 Annotated Educator Input Survey" compiled by Metis Associates here:

https://arteducators-prod.s3.amazonaws.com/documents/2262/ee3a3537-0ae5-4ba5-83b8-7e2c62bde26d.pdf?17 17522107

THE CHARGE

NAEA stands committed to supporting our current and future visual arts, design, and media arts educators.

Teacher burnout pronounced during the pandemic (Walker, 2021; Westphal et al., 2022), the rise in school violence (Peist et al., 2024; Walker, 2022b), ongoing cultural wars (Rogers & Kahne, 2022; Woo et al., 2022), unsatisfactory working conditions (Kraft & Lyon, 2022), and inequitable workloads (Geiger & Pivovarova, 2018; Skaalvik & Skaalvik, 2011), among other reasons, make recruiting and retaining (Harts Research Associates & Matthews, 2022; Walker, 2022a) art teachers increasingly difficult. To better address the challenges current art educators face and understand the crux of new art teacher recruitment and educator staffing shortages, in December 2022 the NAEA Board approved the formation of a national Art Education Teacher Recruitment and Retention Task Force. The Task Force, representing all NAEA Divisions and Regions, investigated the obstacles and opportunities to entering and serving the field of visual arts, design, and media arts education, including looking at all segments of the continuum; i.e., recruitment, preparation, practice/service, and retention. This group engaged with the membership, peer organizations, and external experts to gather data and draft this report of findings and recommendations for short-, mid-, and long-term action to be presented to the Board.

BACKGROUND

The Task Force, led by Co-Chairs Theresa McGee and Cathy Rosamond and closely supported by NAEA's Executive Director, Mario Rossero, selected eight members out of 108 applicants. The eight task force members represent all four Regions (Eastern, Western, Southeastern, and Pacific) and seven Divisions (Elementary, Middle, Secondary, Higher Education, Preservice,

Supervision/Administration, and Museum Education). The Task Force officially kicked off with its first meeting in April 2023. During the first meeting, the members pooled their knowledge and thoughts on a Jamboard, which resulted in a list of varied issues surrounding teacher retention and recruitment.



BASELINE SURVEY FOR STATE LEADERSAPRIL 2023

In order to prepare for the work ahead, a baseline survey was shared with all state association leaders during the Delegates Assembly in April 2023 to gauge state leaders' insights on recruitment and retention in the field of art education. In the survey, the state representatives confirmed the challenging landscape for current art teachers nationwide. However, we also learned how vastly varied the circumstances and situations are in each state and school district when considering factors such as licensure requirements for art teachers, hiring practices, student population, class size, political climate, and teacher pay. While most states have high school "arts" requirements at the high school or secondary school level, most state leaders responded that there are few to no incentives for school districts to support fine arts programs. Further, state representatives confirmed that many art teachers were leaving the profession, creating vacant art teaching positions that schools and districts cannot fill. Reasons for art teachers leaving the profession include low compensation, long hours, the changing political climate, being asked to perform unrelated work, overcrowding of classrooms, lack of respect as professional art educators, not receiving enough support from their administration, art as a subject not being valued, and losing tenure and pay level when moving to another state or district. Overall, the word "burnout" stood out in many responses.

THE CORE WORK OF THE TASK FORCE

The Task Force met monthly between March 2023 and April 2024 to review data and trends and identify areas for support and recommendations. In July 2023, the co-chairs also met with "All Stars," an additional group of colleagues with specific areas of relevant expertise and experience, to gather recent literature to increase understanding and address the obstacles faced by new and current art educators across the United States.

Armed with a better understanding of factors, informed by research and data, that were adversely affecting new art teacher recruitment and retention of art teachers, the co-chairs worked on constructing a National Survey that focused on successes and creative solutions to the myriad issues plaguing the art teaching profession. The "All Stars" group reviewed and suggested the wording of the survey questions. The Task Force also contributed and agreed to the survey questions. The Task Force members focused on analyzing and discussing the results from the large-scale National Survey, working to align survey findings with relevant research from the literature review. The work completed by the Teacher Retention and Recruitment Task Force culminated in this report with recommendations to the NAEA Board.

THE NATIONAL SURVEY SEPTEMBER 2023

In September 2023, a large-scale National Survey was shared with NAEA's full contact list, including members and nonmembers, in the visual arts, design, and media arts education field. This survey aimed to identify strengths, challenges, and opportunities. There were more than 3,500 responses, with 89% currently teaching visual arts, design, or media arts in a preK–12 school (public, private, or charter/other). The vast majority (80.61%) of respondents were certified art teachers who obtained their licensure through traditional undergraduate or graduate programs at colleges and universities. The Task Force took a particular interest in the 16.29% who received their credentials through an alternative route as a potential pathway for bringing in quality art educators.



THE NATIONAL SURVEY | FINDINGS

The following pages are a summary of the findings from the National Survey, organized into two parts: Recruitment and Retention.

In terms of how to encourage others to join the art teaching profession, many suggested highlighting the *rewards of teaching* and reminding new or future art teachers that *it is a career that enables artists to continue to grow creatively*.



THE NATIONAL SURVEY | FINDINGS: RECRUITMENT -

Reasons for Becoming an Art Teacher

Many respondents indicated they were primarily drawn to a career in art education due to their love for art and the joy of teaching. Respondents listed these two factors together, saying the opportunity to work as an artist while helping young people develop creative-thinking skills most attracted them to the profession (Metis Associates, 2023).

One respondent shared, "Combining my love of working with children and my love of art felt like the perfect job. I feel like the best reason to teach is having a passion to pass on your knowledge to others." Similarly, another respondent added, "I wanted to share my passion [for] art and art history with other people and to teach them to think more creatively about life and the visual world. Seeing growth in student work really makes it worth it."

Along with these motivations, several respondents highlighted the flexibility of the art curriculum compared to other school disciplines and opportunities to provide art experiences they felt were valuable during students' formative years as reasons for someone to choose to be an art educator.

I feel like the best reason to teach is having a passion to pass on your knowledge to others.

What attracted you to the field of art education?



THE NATIONAL SURVEY | FINDINGS: RECRUITMENT -

Encouraging Words For Future Art Teachers

In terms of how to encourage others to join the art teaching profession, many suggested highlighting the "rewards of teaching" and reminding new or future art teachers that it is a career that "enables artists to continue to grow creatively" (Metis Associates, 2023).

Several commented on the unique nature of art in schools since it is generally not a tested subject, which gives teachers "greater flexibility in designing curriculum and crafting engaging activities" (Metis Associates, 2023). The learning that happens in art class often extends far beyond the school walls. A respondent articulated this sentiment: "When you can be the only place a student can feel safe and heard, a place to give students the skills of creative and critical thinking through [the] expression of their art, that is a place to enter into!" A seasoned art teacher reflected, "I've learned more about myself as an artist through teaching others," and another shared, "If you want to stay young, be a lifelong learner, and [be] challenged daily, then visual arts education is for you."

Be a working artist. Teaching is one way to do that with a steady income. >>

Why should someone become an art teacher?



Share Your Passion

Art Imparts Important Life Skills

THE NATIONAL SURVEY | FINDINGS: RECRUITMENT

Recruiting Art Teachers From Underrepresented Groups

When asked about how the art education field might be able to attract more teachers from underrepresented groups, respondents emphasized the importance of bolstering efforts to recruit artists and students from these communities, specifically noting that there should be direct, accessible pathways for them to enter the field.

Once these pathways are established, respondents stressed the need for strategies to retain these individuals as they pursue their degrees and certifications.

This retention-focused approach could involve initiatives such as scholarships, grants, or pay for student teachers (Metis Associates, 2023). One respondent commented, "This has to start when underrepresented populations are in school. If a student has a strong art educator, it can be life-changing. We need to encourage all students to see the arts and education as viable, financially feasible career options," suggesting that recruitment can be targeted at K–12 students.

However, it is noteworthy that many respondents underscored the need to prioritize recruiting gualified teachers, regardless of their background or identities. Many respondents chose to comment on more prominent issues teachers face, even voicing that they were not aware that diversifying the field of art education was a problem that needed to be addressed (Metis Associates, 2023). One respondent suggested focusing on the underlying issues: "Make the art teaching jobs more attractive. [Fund] the struggling schools properly and allocate funds in more meaningful ways. wouldn't want to teach at a school where I had 8 classes a day and no art supplies. We can encourage our diverse populations to go into education, but if educators keep getting treated poorly, more so every year, that will not happen."

What suggestions do you have to recruit or support more diverse and underrepresented preK-12 art educators?



If a student has a strong art educator, it can be life-changing.

THE NATIONAL SURVEY | FINDINGS: RETENTION

Administrator Support

Most respondents commented on the importance of administrators supporting their work as art teachers. A recurrent theme was how they felt valued when administrators publicly acknowledged art teachers by encouraging students' work to be displayed outside the art room, taking an interest in what was happening in the art room, recognizing them through social media or awards, attending art shows, or simply expressing gratitude for their hard work (Metis Associates, 2023).

A respondent shared, "My school voted me Teacher of the Year this year. My administrator includes me in all aspects of school activities, meetings, and events. My admin[istrator] praises me often and shows that I, along with art, am valued." Another area of key support was art teachers receiving enough funding for materials and professional development, including attending conferences. Respondents strongly emphasized the importance of feeling heard when their administrators make an effort to foster trust and respect for their work as art teachers (Metis Associates, 2023).

Half the survey respondents sought concrete support from administrators in areas of classroom management, discipline, and scheduling by recognizing and respecting art teachers as professionals (Metis Associates, 2023). One respondent emphasized the need for administrators who "give time in the classroom for art teachers, who understand that art teachers are constantly setting up materials, and who give support on extreme misconduct from students." A respondent surmised, "I think that professional courtesy and autonomy go a long way. I am the expert in my field, and my administrators trust what I tell them about what I do and what I need. Having supportive administrators goes a long way." What innovative supports and/or incentives would/do keep you or others in the teaching profession?



I am the expert in my field, and my administrators trust what I tell them Having supportive administrators goes a long way.

THE NATIONAL SURVEY | FINDINGS: RETENTION

Professional Development and Mentorship

Many respondents emphasized the importance of being involved in state and national art education associations for their professional development (PD). Local art museums, universities and colleges, and their school districts also provided valuable PD opportunities.

Several respondents noted that PD that is explicitly focused on different arts curricula (Advanced Placement, International Baccalaureate, etc.) are particularly informative, underpinning the importance for art teachers to retain control over their curricula. In addition, attending PD sessions that focus on their personal art practice or projects is also relevant for their professional growth (Metis Associates, 2023). In addition to PD, many stated the value of community support and mentorship in advancing their careers. As one respondent said, "Another art educator has been my hero! She has helped me enter the art profession and feel successful!"

Another art educator has been my hero! She has helped me enter the art profession and feel successful! Describe any outstanding professional learning opportunities, communities, or mentorship programs that have supported you or your colleagues as an art educator.



THE NATIONAL SURVEY | FINDINGS: RETENTION

Implementing Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion in the Changing Political Climate

The survey included a question on how art teachers around the country might be implementing ED&I in their curricula and pedagogies, since NAEA prioritizes ED&I in the current Strategic Vision. Many respondents referred to using culturally responsive frameworks to include diverse artists and artworks in their curriculum.

Many responses indicated that these frameworks nurture student voice and choice compared to more traditional arts curricula. A respondent who models culturally responsive teaching stated, "I make sure art examples are [the] ones my students can relate to and find inspiration from" (Metis Associates, 2023). Further, many respondents stated that they made an effort to create an inclusive learning environment to ensure all students feel welcome to express themselves through art (Metis Associates, 2023).

Some specific responses focused on diversity that extended beyond race and culture—several respondents mentioned including artists with disabilities, as well as LGBTQ+ and Indigenous artists, in their curricula. There were respondents who commented on the challenges of teaching an ED&I curriculum based on the lack of support from community members, district leaders, or state policies. One participant stated, "I have had to be very careful about which artists I refer to and what I say in classes. This is an area that still needs lots of work in my district" (Metis Associates, 2023). What successes have you had in implementing equity, diversity, & inclusion in your curriculum while navigating the current political climate?



Little to No Success

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE BOARD

The Task Force came up with 13 recommendations for the Board's consideration. These recommendations are based mainly on the results from the National Survey (3,500+ art educators responded), analyzed professionally by Metis Associates, and the Task Force. The Task Force also considered points raised by the state leaders in the Baseline Survey and consulted the most current literature on teacher retention and shortage issues in the United States.

C Teaching [art] is an incredibly enriching and rewarding experience on a daily basis, and we make kids' lives better by providing them the time and resources to explore their identities and their ideas!

Short-Term Recommendations (IMMEDIATE TO 6 MONTHS)



Recommendation (1): Include Art Teacher Recruitment and Retention in the 2026–2030 NAEA Strategic Vision as a priority area to support and address. This could be embedded across all five pillars.

Pillar(s): ED&I, Learning, Research & Knowledge, Advocacy & Policy, Community Vibrancy

Rationale: The data collected from NAEA Delegates, members, and other art educators clearly indicate continued challenges ahead in recruiting and retaining art teachers. Emergent themes outlined in the recommendations below clarify the numerous, complex challenges that make the recruitment and retention of art teachers increasingly difficult. It is imperative for NAEA to prioritize addressing these challenges and their impact on the NAEA community across all pillars.

A

Recommendation (2): Create guidance and informational document(s), such as position statements and one-pagers directed at school administrators and district leaders emphasizing the significance and advantages of hiring fully certified/credentialed visual arts teachers in K–12 schools. These documents include a list of best practices and a list of arts-focused professional development offerings (Lind, 2007) covering an array of topics, such as unique classroom management required in the art room, collaborative scheduling with art teachers, understanding how a strong art curriculum leads to broadening students' knowledge and skills, and recognizing art teachers as trained professionals and core members of the teaching staff (Gates, 2010).

Pillar(s): Learning, Advocacy & Policy

Rationale: Administrator support is essential to healthy working conditions for arts educators and advancing the positive school culture and climate supported by quality arts education (NAEA, 2016/2019a).

Half the survey respondents strongly indicated a desire for additional support from their administrators and a tendency for art educators' needs to be overlooked due to the lack of accountability in state education metrics (report cards) and a lack of understanding of the arts' value in nurturing broader academic success. Respondents emphasized the need for administrators who value and support the arts similarly to other subjects, develop "positive, trusting relationships with art teachers," and view art educators as "experts in their field." (Metis Associates, 2023, pp. 6–7). Another common theme that emerged was the need for action to address more systemic issues, including smaller class sizes and more effective management of student behavior (Metis Associates, 2023). Collaborative school environments, strong administrative leadership, and dedicated professional development opportunities foster teacher satisfaction and retention (Eisner, 2002; Hsieh, 2023).

This recommended position statement would outline how adequate time for planning, flexible scheduling, reduced nonteaching duties, access to high-quality materials, and manageable student-teacher ratios contribute to job satisfaction and teacher well-being (Cardona, 2023; Carter & Triggs, 2017). The position statement and resources should be shared with principal and superintendent associations, administration associations, and state arts education leaders. An educational forum or other NAEA programming should be held to amplify the message and make administrators aware of art educators' needs. An important component of the resource is the inclusion of a list of arts-specific professional learning administrators can use to support their art educators, such as the NAEA Professional Learning Studio and other potential PD packages for districts offered by state associations and/or NAEA (NAEA, 2011/2019b).



Recommendation (3): Develop a strategy to partner and reach out to higher education institutions with accredited teacher education programs in art education that actively seek to train new preservice art educators from underserved and underrepresented populations. The strategy should also include new NAEA scholarship opportunities that help higher education programs recruit institutionally underserved and historically resilient students pursuing careers in teaching visual arts.

Pillar(s): ED&I, Community Vibrancy

Rationale: This recommendation emphasizes the importance of the 2019 NAEA ED&I Task Force Recommendation 14 to the NAEA Board of Directors: "Create a series of programs to recruit underrepresented art education professionals into the field of art education."

Developing a specific strategy to recruit preservice art education professionals into both the field at large and into the NAEA community aligns with NAEA's continued support of ED&I principles while enhancing the vibrancy of the NAEA community (NAEA, 2016/2021). Nurturing artistic talent within diverse communities and offering scholarships can attract promising candidates and support professionals reflecting the diversity of the school community (National Association of School Psychologists, 2020). Additional research suggests that teachers from diverse backgrounds are more likely to hold beliefs and use classroom practices associated with improved outcomes for all students, including students of color (Blazar, 2022).

One element of this strategy could include developing partnerships with Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs) and colleges and universities in geographic locations that specialize in serving underrepresented preservice art educators. These partnerships would help introduce preservice art educators to NAEA and its resources to develop a foundational relationship. A second element of this strategy could include establishing NAEA-funded tuition scholarship(s) exclusively available to underrepresented preservice art educators (perhaps with the support of the National Art Education Foundation).



Recommendation (4): Establish an advocacy campaign targeting decision makers that outlines the value and impact of hiring fully certified art educators. NAEA should partner and share this resource with other advocacy-oriented organizations, teacher unions, and principal and superintendent associations.

Pillar(s): Advocacy & Policy, Community Vibrancy

Rationale: This recommendation is aligned with the objectives listed in the Advocacy & Policy strategic pillar. Leveraging potential allies to amplify the message included in the advocacy toolkit will be imperative to

advance the message beyond the sphere of arts education supporters.

In recent years, states have increasingly moved toward provisional and emergency credentials for educators,

botentially filling art education positions with teachers who are not certified in visual arts education. The baseline survey responses from state leader (April 2023) showed clear trends in the easing of licensure requirements and abbreviated or alternative pathways to certification alongside increased emergency or provisional licenses in their states. While these actions partially address the teacher shortage at large, NAEA should advocate for maintaining a commitment to prioritizing certified/licensed visual arts educators (NAEA, 2010/2019).

Quality accredited preservice programs that emphasize artistic practice and effective pedagogy, along with

meaningful internships and mentorship opportu can better equip graduates for the realities of ar teaching (Clotfelte, et al., 2007; Gnedko-Berry et 2020; NAEA, 2021

Student testimonials and personal stories (see Recommendation 5) should be selected to highl impact of quality arts instruction reflective of e teaching crecentials and experience. Additic data points and figures on the impact of t academic accument, leadership skills economy care bolster the case for art education professionals (America 2012).

Mid-Term Recommendations (6 MONTHS TO 2 YEARS)



Recommendation (5): Create a multipronged nationwide PR campaign that promotes art education as a profession and the value of art education. This campaign would address arts-interested elementary and middle school students and continue through secondary, college, and adult learners. Campaign materials would additionally promote art education as an important profession and vital subject to families and decision makers (administrators, counselors, career advisors, etc.).

Pillar(s): ED&I, Advocacy & Policy, Community Vibrancy

Rationale: Enhanced public understanding of the value of art education and increased advocacy efforts could improve the profession's image and attract new talent (Doan, Steiner, Pandey, & Woo, 2023; Doan, Steiner, & Woo, 2023). Targeted messaging developed by the NAEA community can help shape perspectives about the arts in education by promoting the arts as an essential, core subject (and not "extra" or "special"). Instructional consistency that is equitable with other core academic subjects, both tested and nontested, should be emphasized. Survey respondents reported challenges with respect from the school community members, many of whom do not value the arts in education. There needs to be a shift in mindset to consider the arts as critical not only for creative expression and cultural understanding but also for improving academic success for students (NAEA, 2011/2019d).

The National Survey respondents indicated they were "drawn to a career in art education due to their love for art and the joy of teaching" and the "flexibility of the art curriculum compared to other school disciplines" (Metis Associates, 2023, p. 4). NAEA can collect and share testimonials from its members highlighting these joys and other positive aspects of teaching art alongside personal stories from students about the importance of the arts in their education. One respondent shared an innovative idea for a possible PR campaign: "Find famous people leaders, politicians, and entertainers willing to film testimonials about how an [art] teacher changed their life and helped them become who they are."

Emphasis should begin with targeting young (elementary and middle school) students to help shift the mindset early. In addition, particular focus should be given to highlighting stories of underrepresented educators to help emphasize the viability of art education as a career for students from underrepresented populations. This aligns with NAEA's Equity, Diversity, & Inclusion objectives of providing information on career pathways in art education to inform students, families, and decision makers (NAEA, 2021). This targeted campaign should include key points about the value of the arts and arts education, such as how the arts foster perseverance, self-discipline, and self-awareness, as well as strengthen student engagement (Varner, 2020).



Recommendation (6): Create an administrator "look-for" toolkit tailored to visual arts, design, and media arts educators to support successful and positive art educator performance evaluation experiences with supervisors, aligned to current teacher evaluation tools and trends. This toolkit should be shared broadly across networks, including principal and superintendent associations.

Pillars: Learning, Community Vibrancy

Rationale: Survey responses indicated a lack of administrator support for their roles as art educators due to a lack of understanding of core aspects of quality art education. Respondents also indicated the need to address larger issues in the art room, such as requiring smaller class sizes and guiding teachers to effectively manage student behavior.

A toolkit should be designed to help supervisors understand what to "look for" when observing art learning and evaluating art educators and would provide a baseline understanding for supervisors. Additional guidance on best practices regarding scheduling, contact minutes with students, teaching conditions, discipline expectations concerning safety in the lab environment, and visual and media arts national standards would help educators educate their supervisors (Cardona, 2023). Content from existing NAEA resources and position statements, such as the NAEA Position Statement on Physical Safety in the Art Classroom (NAEA, 2014/2022) and NAEA Position Statement on Scheduling, Time, Enrollment, Facilities, Funding and/or Resources for Visual Arts Education (NAEA, 2011/2019c), can be used to build the toolkit, and adapt existing "look-for" guidance from different regions.



Recommendation (7): Expand and promote youth-focused programming to entice K–12 students to enter the profession of art education and other art-focused creative careers, especially those with the least access nationally.

Pillar(s): ED&I, Community Vibrancy

Rationale: Recruiting potential art educators needs to begin at an early age, with K–12 students seeing the arts and art education as viable careers. For example, developing and providing robust student programming for NAHS and NJAHS chapters heightens the visibility of arts-related careers while strengthening students' relationships with their visual arts educators. Involving K–12 students in art education programming from an early age builds community awareness and support while fostering student leadership and service opportunities in the arts. Youth-focused programming such as art clubs, exhibitions, and competitions were identified in the state leaders' baseline survey as elevating the role of art educators. Expanding, coordinating, and promoting these opportunities can better support the visibility of the arts for students and their communities (NAEA, 2016/2019b).

As noted by multiple survey respondents, student engagement with a strong, passionate art educator can be life changing, particularly in encouraging underserved populations to consider a future in arts education (Metis Associates, 2023). These relationships can foster natural pathways for students from underserved populations (Farinde-Wu et al., 2020; Steiner et al., 2022) to enter the field of art education (see also Recommendation 3).



Recommendation (8): Develop professional learning offerings that support art educators' personal artistic practice and nurture their individual creativity.

Pillar(s): Learning, Research & Knowledge

Rationale: A key theme emerging from the survey analysis is an emphasis on art education as a unique career that enables artists to continue to grow creatively, sustain themselves financially, and inspire future generations of artists (Metis Associates, 2023). Respondents expressed a desire to deepen their artistic practice through workshops, retreats, and studio project grants. Funding for personal art projects and attending relevant professional development sessions were identified as significant contributors to positive, supportive professional growth (Metis Associates, 2023).

Championing the joys of making art as part of the art education field emerged as a major theme in supporting teacher recruitment and retention—to both encourage people to enter the field and to remind them of one of the uniquely attractive aspects of their chosen careers. A love for the arts and strong artistic skills are key motivators for entering and remaining in the field (Eisner, 2002; Graham & Zwirn, 2010; Pellegrino, 2011).

NAEA can play a key role in fully supporting art educators' pedagogy and artistic practice by supporting members of the NAEA community through potential partnerships with existing professional growth opportunities centered on artistic practice, as well as developing its own programming specifically designed to nurture art educators' artistic practice (Lawton, 2016). Programming might include webinars on artistic practices and hands-on workshops.



Recommendation (9): Develop and market arts-specific professional development packages for school districts, working with existing NAEA offerings and state offerings. Prioritize areas noted in the survey, such as classroom management and ED&I issues (e.g., cultural appropriation).

Pillar(s): ED&I, Learning, Community Vibrancy

Rationale: NAEA has a rich history of providing and encouraging meaningful professional development uniquely designed for visual arts educators (NAEA, 2011/2019b). Historically, these offerings have been targeted at NAEA members at large, typically at individual levels. As indicated in the survey, art educators working in K–12 environments often lack control or influence over the professional development they receive from their school districts. A major theme among respondents was the desire to be valued as a specialized expert in the visual arts field, with the desire to advocate for professional learning supporting their unique needs alongside control over their curricula (Metis Associates, 2023).

NAEA is in a unique position to develop professional learning packages using existing NAEA and state content and offer these packages to districts as a supplement or alternative to district-wide professional development that does not address the specific needs of art educators. Ongoing professional development opportunities that address specific needs and encourage innovation, along with robust peer networks, can foster teacher growth and combat isolation (Guskey & Yoon, 2009).

Content for these packages can be driven by areas of specific need noted in the survey, NAEA programming feedback surveys, and state-specific areas of interest. It is noteworthy that a portion of the respondents mentioned specific challenges in incorporating ED&I efforts in their classrooms due to a lack of support from district leaders and community members. Specially curated NAEA packages can support districts and their arts educators in navigating some of these challenges. Additionally, the NAEA Museum Education Division can play a key role in contributing content ideas and themes connected to regional programming.



Recommendation (10): Develop a formal mentorship program for early career professionals that connects preservice and beginning educators with experienced members to support a range of arts-related curricula, instruction, and assessment needs.

Pillar(s): Learning, Community Vibrancy

Rationale: Survey respondents suggested mentorship programs targeting early career professionals would help retain art educators, underscoring the importance of expanding opportunities to foster community via mentorship (Metis Associates, 2023). Community and membership were identified as the majority source for support survey respondents. Many art educators are isolated in their teaching environment, sometimes as the only art teacher in a building or district. Although NAEA professional learning activities already offer early career professionals some opportunities to seek guidance from fellow art educators, a formal mentorship program would enable the sustained connections crucial to fully supporting beginning educators (Hanawalt & Hofsess, 2020). Meaningful mentorship opportunities can better prepare graduates for the realities of art teaching (Yost, 2006).

A robust mentorship program would consist of ongoing support beginning in preservice teaching and continuing through the first 5 years of teaching, with a dedicated professional learning track for these early career educators (virtual gatherings, Convention sessions, etc.). Mentors might be identified through an open call to veteran educators interested in supporting the NAEA community. Several survey respondents who were late in their careers or who were retirees indicated a willingness to mentor. A formal mentorship program would help create a coordinated pipeline of art education students in partnership with cooperating teachers and college and university art education programs, bringing new professionals into the NAEA community at a formative stage in their new careers.

Long-Term Recommendations (MORE THAN 2 YEARS)



Recommendation (11): Implement a three-pronged approach to address the impact of Career Technical Education (CTE) on visual arts and media educators' teaching positions and working conditions: (1) foster collaboration between NAEA and CTE organizations; (2) create guidance for current visual and media arts teachers seeking to obtain CTE certification and the potential benefits of this certification; and (3) identify work-based learning standards and career pathways in visual arts, design, and media arts education that align with CTE frameworks at the state and national levels.

Pillar(s): Learning, Community Vibrancy, Research & Knowledge

Rationale: CTE implementation has a variety of effects on visual arts educators and visual arts education programs. In some cases, CTE courses are replacing visual and media arts courses and issuing visual arts credit despite not being taught by a certified art educator (NAEA, 2013/2019). Collaboration between CTE organizations and programs and NAEA would allow NAEA to advocate for best practices in art-related CTE courses (Sanders, 2022), serve as a professional learning resource for CTE teachers, and potentially expand NAEA membership to include CTE-certified artists and other creative professionals (D'Sousa, 2024).

Many art educators are eligible to obtain CTE certification but are unaware of the pathways or requirements to do so, as well as the potential benefits ranging from increased supply and facility funding levels (many states have funds earmarked exclusively for CTE) and access to fill teaching positions reserved for CTE-certified educators.



Recommendation (12): Establish a higher education committee or working group to develop a recommendation document articulating minimum standards for teacher certification in visual arts education to be shared with governing educational bodies and alternative-track certification programs.

Pillar(s): Advocacy & Policy, Community Vibrancy

Rationale: The survey results and task force research underscored the wide range of certification requirements in the United States for teachers entering the art education field. States have implemented emergency provisions for certification in response to the national teacher shortage alongside expanded offerings for alternative certification programs nationwide. A guidance document on "best practices" will help both educational bodies and alternative-track programs align their policies with NAEA's recommendations to ensure high-quality visual arts education (Ronfeldt et al., 2020; Scott, 2019). The proposed Higher Education Committee would survey state certification policies and quality, robust alternative certification programs to develop a document outlining a baseline standard for art education certification. This recommendation builds upon the general guidance offered in the Position Statements on Certified/Licensed Visual Arts Educators in PreK-12 School Settings (2010/2019) and Pre-service Education and its Relationship to Higher Education (2011/2019a).



Recommendation (13): Formulate a state and federal policy agenda for a set of recommended actions to support art education, such as increased funding for Title II, which can be used to support mentoring and content-specific professional development; increased salaries and other financial incentives for teachers; scholarships and grants for student teachers and ongoing mentorship for new teachers; and the inclusion of achievement in art education in state accountability measures.

Pillar(s): Advocacy & Policy

Rationale: A major theme emerging from the delegates' baseline survey in response to why educators are leaving the art education field was the low pay combined with challenging teaching conditions. These findings are confirmed in multiple current studies on the education profession (Bryant et al., 2023). Despite asking for solutions outside of higher pay in the national survey, respondents urged NAEA to push for policy efforts toward "competitive wages" and increased benefits for teachers (Metis Associates, 2023, p. 11).

A state and federal policy agenda would strengthen NAEA's response to the recommendations in this document concerning much-needed mentorship for new teachers to enhance teacher retention (Recommendation 10) and recruitment initiatives, such as scholarships and other financial incentives for preservice teachers about to enter the field (Recommendation 3). In partnership with other arts organizations, NAEA could push for greater support from policy makers with specific asks similar to those put forward by the National Association for Music Education (Confredo et al., 2023).

A policy agenda advocating to include art education data on statewide accountability measures (report cards) would further enhance the recognition and public support for quality arts education needed to recruit and retain educators emphasized in Recommendations 4 and 5. NAEA can help craft policy strategies for arts state accountability measures for all publicly funded elementary and high schools, currently only established in Illinois (VanderBrug, 2020). Coupled with advocacy for certified arts educators, such a policy would naturally lead to increased retention and elevated respect for arts educators.

REFERENCES

ay

- Americans for the Arts. (2012). Arts education navigator: Facts and figures. https://www.americansforthearts.org/by-program/reports-and-data/legislation-policy/naappd/arts-education-naviga tor-facts-figures
- Blazar, D. (2022). Teachers of color, culturally responsive teaching, and student outcomes: Experimental evidence from the random assignment of teachers to classes (EdWorkingPaper No. 21-501). Annenberg Institute at Brown University. https://doi.org/10.26300/jym0-wz02
- Bryant, J., Ram, S., Scott, D., & Williams, C. (2023, March 2). K–12 teachers are quitting. What would make them stay?
 McKinsey.
 https://www.mckinsey.com/industries/education/our-insights/k-12-teachers-are-quitting-what-would-make-them-st
- Cardona, M. A. (2023, March). *Guiding principles for creating safe, inclusive, supportive, and fair school climates.* U.S. Department of Education. https://www2.ed.gov/policy/gen/guid/school-discipline/guiding-principles.pdf
- Carter, M. R., & Triggs, V. (Eds.). (2017). Arts education and curriculum studies: The contributions of Rita L. Irwin. Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315467016
- Clotfelter, C. T., Ladd, H. F., & Vigdor, J. L. (2007, January). *How and why do teacher credentials matter for student achievement?* (Working Paper No. 12828). National Bureau of Economic Research. https://doi.org/10.3386/w12828
- Confredo, D. A., Abril, C. R., & Adderley, C. L. (Eds.). (2023). *A blueprint for strengthening the music teacher profession*. National Association for Music Education. https://nafme.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/11/NAF072-MusicInitiative-8.pdf
- Doan, S., Steiner, E. D., Pandey, R., & Woo, A. (2023, June 21). *Teacher well-being and intentions to leave: Findings from the 2023 State of the American Teacher Survey*. RAND. https://www.rand.org/pubs/research_reports/RRA1108-8.html
- Doan, S., Steiner, E. D., & Woo, A. (2023, June 21). *State of the American teacher survey: 2023 technical documentation and survey results*. RAND. https://www.rand.org/pubs/research_reports/RRA1108-7.html
- D'Sousa, K. (2024, January 8). Career Technical Education: A pathway for arts educators. *EdSource*. https://edsource.org/2024/career-technical-education-a-pathway-for-arts-educators/702962
- Eisner, E. W. (2002). The arts and the creation of mind. Yale University Press.
- Farinde-Wu, A., Butler, B. A., & Allen-Handy, A. (2020). Conceptualizing a Black female teacher pipeline: From recruitment to retention to retirement. *Theory Into Practice*, 59(4), 337–347. https://doi.org/10.1080/00405841.2020.1773160
- Gates, L. (2010). Professional development: Through collaborative inquiry for an art education archipelago. *Studies in Art Education*, *52*(1), 6–17. http://www.jstor.org/stable/25746078
- Geiger, T., & Pivovarova, M. (2018). The effects of working conditions on teacher retention. *Teachers and Teaching*, 24(6), 604–625. https://doi.org/10.1080/13540602.2018.1457524
- Gnedko-Berry, N., Park, S. J., Liu, F., Borman, T. H., & Manzeske, D. (2020). How is the concentration of National Board Certified teachers related to student achievement and teacher retention? *Teachers College Record*, *122*(12), 1–36. https://doi.org/10.1177/016146812012201202
- Graham, M. A., & Zwirn, S. G. (2010). How being a teaching artist can influence K-12 art education. *Studies in Art Education*, *51*(3), 219–232. https://doi.org/10.1080/00393541.2010.11518804

- Guskey, T. R., & Yoon, K. S. (2009). What works in professional development? *Phi Delta Kappan*, *90*(7), 495–500. http://www.jstor.org/stable/20446159
- Harts Research Associates, & Matthews, K. (2022). Voices from the classroom: Developing a strategy for teacher retention and recruitment. UCLA Center for the Transformation of Schools. https://transformschools.ucla.edu/research/voices-from-the-classroom
- Hanawalt, C., & Hofsess, B. A. (2020). Holding paradox: Activating the generative (im)possibility of art education through provocative acts of mentoring with beginning art teachers. *Studies in Art Education*, *61*(1), 24–45. https://doi.org/10.1080/00393541.2019.1700068
- Hsieh, B. (2023, March 16). Rehumanizing the teaching profession. *ASCD Blog*. https://www.ascd.org/blogs/rehumanizing-the-teaching-profession
- Kraft, M. A., & Lyon, M. A. (2022, November). The rise and fall of the teaching profession: Prestige, interest, preparation, and satisfaction over the last half century (EdWorkingPaper No. 22-679). Annenberg Institute at Brown University. https://doi.org/10.26300/7b1a-vk92
- Lawton, P. H. (2016). Artitudes: Mapping lines of demarcation in art education. *Journal of Social Theory in Art Education*, *36*, 58–64. https://scholarscompass.vcu.edu/jstae/vol36/iss1/7
- Lind, V. (2007). High quality professional development: An investigation of the supports for and barriers to professional development in arts education. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 8(2). http://www.ijea.org/v8n2
- Metis Associates. (2023). Art Education Teacher Recruitment and Retention Task Force: 2023 annotated educator input survey. National Art Education Association.
- NAEA ED&I Task Force. (2019, March 14). Recommendations from the NAEA ED&I Task Force to the NAEA Board of Directors. https:/www.arteducators.org/equity-diversity-inclusion/articles/608-national-task-force-on-equity-diversity-inclusion
- National Art Education Association. (2019, March). NAEA position statement on certified/licensed visual art educators in pre-K through 12 school settings. (Original statement adopted 2010). https://www.arteducators.org/advocacy-policy/articles/503-naea-position-statement-on-certified-licensed-visual-arteducators-in-pre-k-through-12-school-settings
- National Art Education Association. (2019a, March). *NAEA position statement on pre-service education and its relationship to higher education*. (Original statement adopted 2011). https://www.arteducators.org/advocacy-policy/articles/529-naea-position-statement-on-pre-service-education-and-i ts-relationship-to-higher-education
- National Art Education Association. (2019b, March). NAEA position statement on professional development. (Original statement adopted 2011). https://www.arteducators.org/advocacy-policy/articles/531-naea-position-statement-on-professional-development
- National Art Education Association. (2019c, March). NAEA position statement on scheduling, time, enrollment, facilities, funding and/or resources for visual arts education. (Original statement adopted 2011). https://www.arteducators.org/advocacy-policy/articles/533-naea-position-statement-on-scheduling-time-enrollment -facilities-funding-and-or-resources-for-visual-arts-education

National Art Education Association. (2019d, March). *NAEA position statement on visual arts as part of a well-rounded education*. (Original statement adopted 2011).

https://www.arteducators.org/advocacy-policy/articles/544-naea-position-statement-on-visual-arts-as-part-of-a-well-r ounded-education

National Art Education Association. (2019, March). NAEA position statement on visual art and its relationship to Career Technical Education (CTE). (Original statement adopted 2013).

https://www.arteducators.org/advocacy-policy/articles/543-naea-position-statement-on-visual-art-and-its-relationship -to-career-technical-education-cte

National Art Education Association. (2019a, March). NAEA position statement on positive school culture and climate. (Original statement adopted 2016).

https://www.arteducators.org/advocacy-policy/articles/528-naea-position-statement-on-positive-school-culture-and-c limate

National Art Education Association. (2019b, March). *NAEA position statement on student art contests and competitions*. (Original statement adopted 2016).

https://www.arteducators.org/advocacy-policy/articles/535-naea-position-statement-on-student-art-contests-and-competitions

National Art Education Association. (2021, February). 2021–2025 strategic vision. https://www.arteducators.org/about

- National Art Education Association. (2021, February). *Position statement on achieving an equitable, diverse, and inclusive visual arts education profession*. (Original statement adopted 2016). https://www.arteducators.org/equity-diversity-inclusion/articles/500-position-statement-on-achieving-an-equitable-di verse-and-inclusive-visual-arts-education-profession
- National Art Education Association. (2022, March). NAEA position statement on physical safety in the art classroom. (Original statement adopted 2014).

https://www.arteducators.org/advocacy-policy/articles/527-naea-position-statement-on-physical-safety-in-the-art-clas sroom

National Association of School Psychologists. (2020). *Ready to learn, empowered to teach: Guiding principles for effective schools and successful students* (3rd ed.).

https://www.nasponline.org/research-and-policy/ready-to-learn-empowered-to-teach

- Peist, E., McMahon, S. D., Davis-Wright, J. O., & Keys, C. B. (2024). Understanding teacher-directed violence and related turnover through a school climate framework. *Psychology in the Schools*, 61(1), 220–236. https://doi.org/10.1002/pits.23044
- Pellegrino, K. (2011). Exploring the benefits of music-making as professional development for music teachers. *Arts Education Policy Review*, *112*(2), 79–88. https://doi.org/10.1080/10632913.2011.546694

Rogers, J., & Kahne, J. (with Ishimoto, M., Kwako, A., Stern, S.C., Bingener, C., Raphael, L., Alkam, S., & Conde, Y.). (2022, November). *Educating for a diverse democracy: The chilling role of political conflict in blue, purple, and red communities*. UCLA's Institute for Democracy, Education, and Access.

https://idea.gseis.ucla.edu/publications/educating-for-a-diverse-democracy

- Ronfeldt, M., Bardelli, E., Truwit, M., Mullman, H., Schaaf, K., & Baker, J. C. (2020). Improving preservice teachers' feelings of preparedness to teach through recruitment of instructionally effective and experienced cooperating teachers: A randomized experiment. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 42(4), 551–575. https://doi.org/10.3102/0162373720954183
- Sanders, D. E. (2022). A comparative study on self perceived efficacy of teaching inclusion between Career Technical Education, fine arts, and general core teachers at a selected school district in Northeast Tennessee [Doctoral dissertation, Milligan University]. Milligan Digital Repository. https://mcstor.library.milligan.edu/handle/11558/6272
- Scott, L. A. (2019). Experience of Black male special education teachers: Are alternative licensure programs the desired route for recruitment and preparation? *Education and Urban Society*, *51*(3), 332–350. https://doi.org/10.1177/0013124517719971
- Skaalvik, E. M., & Skaalvik, S. (2011). Teacher job satisfaction and motivation to leave the teaching profession: Relations with school context, feeling of belonging, and emotional exhaustion. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 27(6), 1029–1038. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2011.04.001
- Steiner, E. D., Greer, L., Berdie, L., Schwartz, H. L., Woo, A., Doan, S., Lawrence, R. A., Wolfe, R. L., & Gittens, A. D. (2022, September 20). Prioritizing strategies to racially diversify the K–12 teacher workforce: Findings from the State of the American Teacher and State of the American Principal surveys. RAND. https://www.rand.org/pubs/research_reports/RRA1108-6.html
- VanderBrug, J. (2020, January). The ESSA Arts Indicator in Illinois: A study in the art of policymaking. National Association of State Boards of Education, pp. 21–25, 45. https://nasbe.nyc3.digitaloceanspaces.com/2020/01/VanderBrug_January-2020-Standard.pdf
- Varner, E. (2020, August 6). Finding sanctuary: Social and emotional learning and visual and performing arts. *NAfME Blog*. https://nafme.org/blog/social-emotional-learning-visual-performing-arts
- Walker, T. (2021, November 12). Getting serious about teacher burnout. *NEA News*. https://www.nea.org/nea-today/all-news-articles/getting-serious-about-teacher-burnout
- Walker, T. (2022a, February 1). Survey: Alarming number of educators may soon leave the profession. *NEA News*. https://www.nea.org/nea-today/all-news-articles/survey-alarming-number-educators-may-soon-leave-profession
- Walker, T. (2022b, March 18). Violence, threats against teachers, school staff could hasten exodus from profession. *NEA News*.

https://www.nea.org/nea-today/all-news-articles/violence-threats-against-teachers-school-staff-could-hasten-exodu s-profession

- Westphal, A., Kalinowski, E., Hoferichter, C. J., & Vock, M. (2022). K–12 teachers' stress and burnout during the COVID-19 pandemic: A systematic review. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *13*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.920326
- Woo, A., Wolfe, R. L., Steiner, E. D., Doan, S., Lawrence, R. A., Berdie, L., Greer, L., Gittens, A. D., & Schwartz, H. L. (2022, August 10). Walking a fine line—educators' views on politicized topics in schooling: Findings from the State of the American Teacher and State of the American Principal surveys. RAND. https://www.rand.org/pubs/research_reports/RRA1108-5.html
- Yost, D. S. (2006). Reflection and self-efficacy: Enhancing the retention of qualified teachers from a teacher education perspective. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 33(4), 59–76. http://www.jstor.org/stable/23478871